

Georgia Institute of Technology  
LEADS Service



ILLiad TN: 251905

**Journal Title:** Annals of Discrete Mathematics  
(Graph theory in memory of G.A. Dirac)

**Call #:** QA166 .G732 1989

**Volume:** 41

**Location:** 3E - 7/10

**Issue:**

**Month/Year:** 1989

**Pages:** 401 - 416

**Article Author:** Trotter

**Article Title:** Problems and Conjectures in the  
Combinatorial Theory of Ordered Sets

William Trotter (wt48)  
School of Mathematics  
Georgia Tech  
Atlanta, GA 30332

**Faculty**  
**Math**

**COPYRIGHT NOTICE:**

This material may be protected by copyright law (Title 17 U.S. Code).

# Problems and Conjectures in the Combinatorial Theory of Ordered Sets

W. T. Trotter\*  
Department of Mathematics  
Arizona State University  
Tempe, Arizona, USA

*Dedicated to the memory of G. A. Dirac*

49 questions from the theory of ordered sets are stated, and the present knowledge about each is surveyed.

## 1 Introduction

The purpose of this article is to survey a number of combinatorial problems and conjectures for ordered sets. This area of combinatorial mathematics is relatively new and is experiencing rapid growth. Accordingly, it is impossible to claim that the article is exhaustive in scope. Rather, we concentrate on problems which fall under the heading of “extremal problems”. Furthermore, we have chosen problems which exhibit the single most attractive feature of combinatorial mathematics in that the problems can be understood by nonspecialists. Throughout the paper, we consider an *ordered set* as a pair  $(X, P)$  where  $X$  is a set and the *partial order*  $P$  is a reflexive, antisymmetric and transitive relation on  $X$ .

## 2 Dimension problems

The *dimension* of an ordered set  $(X, P)$ , denoted  $\dim(X, P)$ , is the least  $t$  for which  $P$  is the intersection of  $t$  linear orders on  $X$ . Our first conjecture is one of the best known problems in dimension theory.

---

\*Research supported in part by the National Science Foundation

**Conjecture 1.** *If  $(X, P)$  is any ordered set with  $|X| \geq 3$ , then there exist distinct points  $x, y \in X$  so that*

$$\dim(X, P) \leq 1 + \dim(X - \{x, y\}, P(X - \{x, y\})).$$

This conjecture arises from attempts to provide a simple inductive proof of the following basic inequality due to T. Hiraguchi [13]:  $\dim(X, P) \leq |X|/2$  when  $|X| \geq 4$ . We believe the first published reference to the conjecture is [3], but the problem is so natural that one cannot be certain. See Kelly's note [16] for additional background information on this problem.

**Conjecture 2.** *For every pair  $m, n$  of positive integers, there exist ordered sets  $(X, P)$  and  $(Y, Q)$  so that*

$$\dim((X, P) \times (Y, Q)) = \max\{\dim(X, P), \dim(Y, Q)\}.$$

This problem comes from the following elementary inequalities governing cartesian products of ordered sets:

$$\max\{\dim(X, P), \dim(Y, Q)\} \leq \dim((X, P) \times (Y, Q)) \quad (1)$$

$$\dim((X, P) \times (Y, Q)) \leq \dim(X, P) + \dim(Y, Q) \quad (2)$$

In many cases, the second inequality is tight. For example, K. Baker [2] showed that this occurs whenever the two ordered sets are nontrivial and have greatest and least elements. However, very little is known about the accuracy of the first inequality. In [34], Trotter showed that for each  $n \geq 3$ , there exists an  $n$ -dimensional, ordered set  $(X, P)$  with the property that  $\dim((X, P) \times (X, P)) = 2n - 2$ . This ordered set is the *standard* example, i.e., the family of all 1-element and  $(n - 1)$ -element subsets of an  $n$ -element set ordered by inclusion. Perhaps it is true that for each  $n \geq 1$ , there exists an ordered set  $(X, P)$  so that  $\dim(X, P) = n$  and  $\dim((X, P) \times (X, P)) = n$ .

The standard example figures in another intriguing dimension theory problem.

**Problem 3.** *For each  $n \geq 1$ , determine the least integer  $f(n)$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is any ordered set in which each point is comparable with at most  $n$  other points, then  $\dim(X, P) \leq f(n)$ .*

Z. Füredi and J. Kahn [10] have supplied a clever argument to show that there exists an absolute constant  $c$  so that  $f(n) \leq cn(\log n)^2$ . On the other hand, the standard example provides the trivial lower bound  $f(n) \geq n + 1$ . Although no better bound is known, it appears likely that  $f(n)/n$  tends to infinity.

An ordered set  $(Y, Q)$  for  $(Y, Q)$  is obtained edges.

**Problem 4.** *Is it true that  $\dim(X, P) \leq \dim(Y, Q)$ ?*

There are many automatic number of graphs to see how far this chromatic number, it relatively large chromatic number, instead, Szemerédi and Trotter and  $G$  has no subgraph of radius in  $G$  is at most  $k(c - 1) + 1$ . The special case was proved by P. Erdős.

**Problem 5.** *What is the maximum dimension of an ordered set on  $n$  points of dimension exceeding  $k$ ?*

A special case of this problem is

**Problem 6.** *What is the maximum dimension of an ordered set on  $n$  points of dimension  $k$ ?*

A solution to the previous problem which is of dimension  $k$

**Problem 7.** *What is the maximum dimension of an ordered set of dimension  $n$  having*

Of course, the dimension of an element set ordered by inclusion is  $n$ . B. Ganter, P. Neverman, and others have shown that the dimension of subspaces of the projective space is at least 5. More generally, this result follows from the fact that for all partitions of an  $n$ -element set, so that  $c_1 n^2 < \dim(\Pi)$ , the dimension of the lattice

$\geq 3$ , then there exist

$\{x, y\}$ ).

simple inductive proof  
 [13]:  $\dim(X, P) \leq$   
 reference to the con-  
 cannot be certain. See  
 on this problem.

rs, there exist ordered

$\dim(Y, Q)$ ).

y inequalities govern-

$$\times (Y, Q) \quad (1)$$

$$\dim(Y, Q) \quad (2)$$

example, K. Baker [2]  
 ts are nontrivial and  
 e is known about the  
 d that for each  $n \geq 3$ ,  
 th the property that  
 e *standard* example,  
 subsets of an  $n$ -element  
 ch  $n \geq 1$ , there exists  
 $(X, P) \times (X, P) = n$ .  
 ng dimension theory

teger  $f(n)$  so that if  
 arable with at most  $n$

rgument to show that  
 $\log n)^2$ . On the other  
 bound  $f(n) \geq n+1$ .  
 y that  $f(n)/n$  tends

An ordered set  $(Y, Q)$  is called a *homeomorph* of  $(X, P)$  if the diagram for  $(Y, Q)$  is obtained from the diagram of  $(X, P)$  by inserting points on edges.

**Problem 4.** *Is it true that if  $(Y, Q)$  is a homeomorph of  $(X, P)$ , then  $\dim(X, P) \leq \dim(Y, Q) \leq 2 \dim(X, P)$ ?*

There are many analogies between dimension for ordered sets and chromatic number of graphs. Here is a problem which comes from attempts to see how far this analogy extends. In order for a graph to have large chromatic number, it must contain a relatively small subgraph which has relatively large chromatic number. To be somewhat more precise, Kierstead, Szemerédi and Trotter [21] proved that if  $G$  is a graph on  $n$  vertices, and  $G$  has no subgraph  $H$  whose chromatic number exceeds  $c$  and whose radius in  $G$  is at most  $2kn^{1/k}$ , then the chromatic number of  $G$  is at most  $k(c-1)+1$ . The special case of this theorem when  $c=2$  was conjectured by P. Erdős.

**Problem 5.** *What is the maximum value  $f(n, m, k)$  of the dimension of an ordered set on  $n$  points in which no subordered set on  $m$  points has dimension exceeding  $k$ ?*

A special case of this problem may be of particular interest.

**Problem 6.** *What is the maximum value  $f(n, k)$  of the dimension of an ordered set on  $n$  points which does not contain a standard example of dimension  $k$ ?*

A solution to the preceding problem may shed some light on the following problem which is due to B. Sands.

**Problem 7.** *What is the least integer  $f(n)$  for which there exists a lattice of dimension  $n$  having  $f(n)$  points?*

Of course, the distributive lattice  $2^n$  consisting of all subsets of an  $n$ -element set ordered by inclusion has dimension  $n$  so  $f(n) \leq 2^n$ . But in [12], B. Ganter, P. Nevermann, K. Reuter and J. Stahl observed that the lattice of subspaces of the projective plane of order 3 has 28 points and dimension at least 5. More generally, they showed that  $f(n) < c^n$  for every  $c > 1$ . This result follows from their observation that if  $\Pi_n$  denotes the lattice of all partitions of an  $n$ -element set, then there exist absolute constants  $c_1, c_2$  so that  $c_1 n^2 < \dim(\Pi_n) < c_2 n^2$ . Perhaps there is an exact answer for the dimension of the lattice of partitions of a set. At least it should be possible



**Conjecture 10.** For every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists an integer  $n$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is any ordered set with  $\text{width}(X, P) \geq n$ , then there exist distinct points  $x, y \in X$  so that  $1/2 - \varepsilon \leq \text{PROB}(x < y) \leq 1/2 + \varepsilon$ .

Additional conjectures of this general flavor are given in Saks' note [31].

There are a number of interesting problems concerning the cardinality of  $E(P)$ . The following problem is relayed by J. Kahn.

**Problem 11.** Does there exist an efficient algorithm which accepts an ordered set  $(X, P)$  as input and which outputs a number  $m$  satisfying that  $m \leq |E(P)| \leq m 2^n$ , where  $n = |X|$ ?

**Problem 12.** For integers  $n, k$  with  $0 \leq k \leq \binom{n}{2}$ , find the greatest integer  $f(n, k)$  for which there exists an ordered set  $(X, P)$  with  $n = |X|$ ,  $|E(P)| = f(n, k)$ , and with exactly  $k$  of the  $\binom{n}{2}$  pairs of  $X$  comparable in  $P$ .

Some information is known about the extremal ordered sets. It is relatively easy to establish that if  $(X, P)$  is an ordered set with  $n$  points and  $k$  comparable pairs and  $|E(P)| = f(n, k)$ , then there exists a function  $g$  from  $X$  to the set  $R$  of real numbers so that  $x < y$  in  $P$  if and only if  $g(x) + 1 < g(y)$ . Such ordered sets are called *semiorders* (also *unit interval orders*). Here is a variant of the preceding problem posed by I. Rival.

**Problem 13.** For integers  $n, k$  with  $0 \leq k \leq n^2/4$ , find the greatest integer  $g(n, k)$  for which there exists an ordered set  $(X, P)$  with  $|X| = n$ ,  $|E(P)| = g(n, k)$ , and with  $k$  edges in the diagram of  $(X, P)$ .

It may also be of interest to find those ordered sets with a specified number of comparable pairs or a specified number of edges in the diagram for which the number of linear extensions is minimum.

Let  $(X, P)$  be an ordered set. For each  $L \in E(P)$ , let  $\text{jump}(L; P)$  count the number of pairs of elements which are consecutive in  $L$  and incomparable in  $P$ . Then define the *jump number* of  $(X, P)$ , denoted  $\text{jump}(X, P)$ , by  $\text{jump}(X, P) = \min\{\text{jump}(L; P) : L \in E(P)\}$ . Call  $(X, P)$  *jump critical* if  $\text{jump}(X - \{x\}, P(X - \{x\})) < \text{jump}(X, P)$  for every  $x \in X$ .

**Problem 14.** For each integer  $k \geq 1$ , find the least integer  $f(k)$  so that if  $\text{jump}(X, P) = k$  and  $(X, P)$  is jump critical, then  $|X| \leq f(k)$ .

El-Zahar and Schmerl [6] show that  $f(k) \leq (k + 1)!$ .



The best known lower bound is due to Erdős and Rival [5] which

is a linear sum of  $n$  two terms. The bounds are comparable. Dilworth [32] has proved that every poset contains a large  $J_n$  or a

chain of length at least  $f(m, n)$ . If  $f(m, n) \geq f(m, n)$ , then either

ms

on the real line. Define a point  $x$  on the real line for  $x \in [a, b]$  isomorphic to one obtained

from an interval order and Dilworth [29] proved the upper bound. [4] showed that there is an interval order of dimension  $n$ . The upper bound is  $(\log \log n)^c$  for some constant  $c$ .  $< c \log \log n$ . This is an open problem.

is an interval order of

for every  $x \in X$ ,

orders are there on  $n$

orders of dimension

the set of nondegenerate intervals  $\{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ .

**Problem 19.** Does there exist a function  $f(n)$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is an interval order and  $\dim(X, P) > f(n)$ , then  $(X, P)$  contains  $I(n)$ ?

The interval count of an interval order is the minimum number of different length intervals required in a representation. P. Fishburn [7] discusses many intriguing problems for interval count and we mention here two of them.

**Conjecture 20.** If  $(X, P)$  is an interval order and  $X$  contains  $3n$  points, then the interval count of  $(X, P)$  does not exceed  $n$ .

The interval order which is defined by  $\{[-2i - 1, 2i + 1] : 0 \leq i \leq n\} \cup \{[-2i - 1, -2i] : 1 \leq i \leq n\} \cup \{[2i, 2i + 1] : 1 \leq i \leq n\}$  shows that this conjecture if true is best possible.

**Problem 21.** Does there exist a constant  $c$  so that the removal of a point from an interval order decreases the interval count by at most  $c$ ?

Consider an angle in the Euclidean plane as determining an infinite region bounded by two incident rays. An ordered set isomorphic to a family of regions formed by angles in the plane and ordered by set inclusion is called an *angle order*. Fishburn and Trotter [8] proved that every interval order is an angle order and that every ordered set with dimension at most four is an angle order. They also proved that there exists an ordered set of dimension 7 which is not an angle order.

**Problem 22.** Find the least integer  $t$  for which there exists an ordered set of dimension  $t$  which is not an angle order.

**Problem 23.** If  $(X, P)$  is an angle order, is the ordered set formed by adding a zero to  $(X, P)$  also an angle order?

Call an ordered set a *circle order* if it is isomorphic to a family of circular regions in the plane ordered by inclusion.

**Problem 24.** Is every three dimensional ordered set a circle order?

**Problem 25.** Find the least integer  $t$  for which there exists an ordered set of dimension  $t$  which is not a circle order.

## 5 Ramsey theoretic problems

Let  $(X, P)$  and  $(Y, Q)$  be ordered sets. We write  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  when every partitioning of the points of  $Y$  into 2 classes yield a subset  $X' \subset Y$



so that  $(X', Q(X'))$  is isomorphic to  $(X, P)$  and all points of  $X'$  belong to the same class.

**Problem 26.** For each  $n \geq 2$ , find the least integer  $f(n)$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is an ordered set of width at most  $n$ , then there exists an ordered set  $(Y, Q)$  of width at most  $f(n)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ .

It is trivial to see that  $2n - 1 \leq f(n) \leq n^2$ . In [23], H. Kierstead and W. Trotter show that  $f(n) \geq 2n$ . The argument for this bound seems to leave room for improvement, and I suspect that  $f(n) > \varepsilon n^2$  for some constant  $\varepsilon$ .

**Problem 27.** For each  $n \geq 1$ , let  $g(n)$  be the least positive integer so that if  $(X, P)$  is any ordered set with  $|X| = n$ , then there exists an ordered set  $(Y, Q)$  with  $|Y| = g(n)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ .

Again, we start with the trivial bounds  $2n - 1 \leq g(n) \leq n^2$ . But in this case, we can at least improve [23] to  $n^2/4 \leq g(n) \leq n^2 - n + 1$ . The reader may naturally ask why we do not pose the analogous problems for dimension and length. The answer is that these problems have been completely solved by Nešetřil and Rödl [26]. They proved that if  $\dim(X, P) = n$ , then there exists  $(Y, Q)$  with  $\dim(Y, Q) = n$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ . Furthermore, if  $\text{length}(X, P) = n$ , there exists  $(Y, Q)$  with  $\text{length}(Y, Q) = 2n - 1$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ . Clearly, these results are best possible.

It follows immediately from Ramsey's theorem that if  $(X, P)$  is an interval order, then there exists an interval order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ .

**Problem 28.** If  $(X, P)$  is an interval order on  $n$  points, what is the least  $f(n)$  so that there exists an interval order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  and the cardinality of  $Y$  is at most  $f(n)$ ?

**Problem 29.** If  $(X, P)$  is an interval order on  $n$  points and has length (respectively width, dimension)  $k$ , what is the least  $f(n, k)$  so that there exists an interval order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  and the length (respectively width, dimension) of  $(Y, Q)$  is at most  $f(n, k)$ ? In particular, does  $f(n, k)$  depend on  $n$ ?

On the other hand, it is relatively easy to see that there exists an angle order  $(X, P)$  for which there is no angle order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ .

**Problem 30.** If  $(X, P)$  is a circle order, does there exist a circle order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ ?

Define the angle  $\alpha$  for which there exists  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  with  $P = A_1 \cap A_2 \cap \dots \cap A_m$ .

**Problem 31.** Find the least  $f(n, \alpha)$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is an angle order and  $x \in X$ , then  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  does there exist a circle order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  and  $x \in Y$ ?

**Problem 32.** If  $(X, P)$  is an angle order, does there exist a circle order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  and  $|Y| \leq f(n)$ ?

**Problem 33.** Does there exist a circle order  $(Y, Q)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$  and  $|Y| \leq f(n)$ ?

Of course, we can pose the obvious question for the parameter  $\alpha$ . Needless to say, there are an endless number of other problems, perhaps more work.

## 6 Problems

Consider the following game. Let  $(X, P)$  be an ordered set,  $B$ , a class  $C$  of ordered sets, and  $(X, P) \in C$ , then  $X$  and  $P$  are players alternate moves. Player  $A$  chooses  $i \leq m$ , Player  $B$  partitions  $P$  into  $\{1, 2, \dots, i\}$  and assigns  $i$  players to  $\{1, 2, \dots, i\}$  in an irrevocable assignment. Player  $A$  chooses a chain in  $(X, P)$ .

The game terminates when  $i \leq m$ , Player  $A$  wins. The assignment of  $i$  players to  $\{1, 2, \dots, i\}$  is the assignment of  $i$  players to  $\{1, 2, \dots, m\}$  for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, m$ .

We say that the game  $(X, P)$  is  $A$ -winning if there exists a strategy for  $A$  regardless of the strategy for  $B$ .

**Problem 34.** What are the  $A$ -winning sets of width  $n$  can be

Define the *angle dimension* of  $(X, P)$ , denoted  $\text{Adim}(X, P)$ , as the least  $t$  for which there exists  $t$  binary relations  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_t$  on  $X$  so that  $P = A_1 \cap A_2 \cap \dots \cap A_t$  and  $(X, A_i)$  is an angle order for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, t$ .

**Problem 31.** Find the least  $f(n, t)$  so that if  $|X| = n$ ,  $\text{Adim}(X, P) = t$ , and  $x \in X$ , then  $\text{Adim}(X - \{x\}, P(X - \{x\})) \geq t - f(n, t)$ . In particular, does there exist a constant  $c$  so that  $f(n, t) \leq c$  for all  $n, t$ ?

**Problem 32.** If  $|X| = n$ , what is the maximum value of  $\text{Adim}(X, P)$ ?

**Problem 33.** Does there exist a function  $f(n)$  so that if  $\text{Adim}(X, P) = n$  then there exists  $(Y, Q)$  with  $\text{Adim}(Y, Q) \leq f(n)$  so that  $(Y, Q) \rightarrow (X, P)$ ?

Of course, we can also define the *circle dimension* of an ordered set in the obvious fashion and rephrase the last three problems in terms of this parameter. Needless to say, the concept of dimension is one that admits an endless number of variations. Some of these have been explored, and perhaps more work on this theme is worthwhile.

## 6 Problems from recursive combinatorics

Consider the following game theoretic setting involving two players  $A$  and  $B$ , a class  $C$  of ordered sets and an integer  $t$ . It is further assumed that if  $(X, P) \in C$ , then  $X = \{1, 2, \dots, m\}$  where  $m$  is some positive integer. The players alternate moves with Player  $A$  constructing an ordered set from  $C$  and Player  $B$  partitioning this ordered set into chains. At Round  $i$ , where  $i \leq m$ , Player  $A$  provides the binary relation determined by the restriction of  $P$  to  $\{1, 2, \dots, i\}$ . After receiving this information, Player  $B$  makes an irrevocable assignment of  $i$  to one of  $t$  sets  $C_1, C_2, \dots, C_t$  each of which is a chain in  $(X, P)$ .

The game terminates and  $A$  is the winner if at some step, say Round  $i$  with  $i \leq m$ , Player  $B$  has no admissible move, i.e., for each  $j = 1, 2, \dots, t$ , the assignment of  $i$  to  $C_j$  produces a set which is no longer a chain. If Player  $B$  is able to make admissible assignments to chains at each Round  $i$  for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, m$ , then Player  $B$  is the winner.

We say that the class  $C$  can be recursively partitioned into  $t$  chains if there exists a strategy for Player  $B$  which will enable him to defeat Player  $A$  regardless of the strategy followed by Player  $A$ .

**Problem 34.** What is the least  $f(n)$  for which the class of finite ordered sets of width  $n$  can be recursively partitioned into  $f(n)$  chains?

It is not at all clear that  $f(n)$  exists. In a beautiful paper [19] H. Kierstead showed that  $f(n) \leq (5^n - 1)/4$ . The best lower bound is due to Szemerédi (see [17]),  $f(n) \geq \binom{n+1}{2}$ . It is of particular interest to decide whether  $f(n)$  is polynomial or exponential. This problem is likely to be difficult since even the precise value of  $f(2)$  is not known. It is either 5 or 6.

Kierstead and Trotter [22] have shown that the class  $I(n)$  of interval orders of width  $n$  can be recursively partitioned into  $3n - 2$  chains. This result is best possible.

In an obvious manner, we can speak of recursively partitioning a class of ordered sets into antichains, recursively coloring a class of graphs, etc. The antichain partitioning problem has been completely solved. J. Schmerl (see [18]) proved that the class  $L(n)$  of ordered sets of length  $n$  can be recursively partitioned into  $\binom{n+1}{2}$  antichains and Szemerédi [18] has shown that the result is best possible.

**Problem 35.** *Does there exist a function  $f(n)$  so that the collection of all comparability graphs in which the maximum size of an independent set is  $n$  can be partitioned into  $f(n)$  complete subgraphs?*

Some nice results have been obtained for recursive dimension. H. Kierstead, G. McNulty and W. Trotter [20] showed that the family of width three ordered sets does not have finite recursive dimension. The difficulty comes from the class of height one ordered sets which are called *crowns*. These ordered sets contain  $k$  maximal elements  $a_1, a_2, \dots, a_k$  and  $k$  minimal elements  $b_1, b_2, \dots, b_k$  with  $a_i > b_i$  and  $a_i > b_{i+1}$  (cyclically) with  $k \geq 3$ . Crowns are three dimensional ordered sets and they are dimension critical. They play a key role in a number of combinatorial problems for ordered sets.

**Problem 36.** *What is the least  $f(n)$  so that the class of width  $n$  crown-free ordered sets has recursive dimension at most  $f(n)$ ?*

A double exponential upper bound and an exponential lower bound for  $f(n)$  is established in [20]. The proof techniques strongly support the following conjecture.

**Conjecture 37.** *For every  $k \geq 3$  and every  $n \geq k$ , the class of ordered sets of width  $n$  which do not contain a crown on  $2m$  points for any  $m$  with  $3 \leq m \leq k$  does not have finite recursive dimension.*

We refer the reader to Kierstead's survey article [18] for additional problems from recursive combinatorics.

## 7 Planarity

An ordered set is planar if it can be drawn in the plane without edge crossings.

**Problem 38.** *What is the minimum number of chains for testing an ordered set for planarity?*

It makes good sense to consider planar graphs which do not contain a cycle of length  $n$ . In this case, we can use duality. The planarity of edges is independent of the orientation of edges. Thus an acyclic oriented graph is planar if and only if the underlying graph is planar.

**Problem 39.** *What is the minimum number of chains for testing an acyclic oriented graph for planarity?*

Some examples of planar graphs are given in the original motivations for recursive dimension theory. A graph has dimension at most  $n$  if and only if it has a planar ordered set with width  $n+1$ . However, D. Kleitman [11] has shown that the dimension of a planar graph is at most  $n$ .

**Problem 40.** *Does every planar graph have recursive dimension at most  $n$ ?*

I have just learned that D. Kleitman has recently proved that every planar graph has recursive dimension at most  $n$ . A set  $(X, P)$  defined by a planar graph  $G$  is an endpoint of a chain if and only if it is a planar graph of width three.

**Problem 41.** *Does every planar graph of genus  $n$ , then the dimension is at most  $n$ ?*

**Problem 42.** *Does every planar graph of recursive dimension  $n$  have chromatic number at most  $n$ ?*

## 7 Planarity

An ordered set is *planar* if it is possible to draw a diagram for it in the plane without edge crossings.

**Problem 38.** *Which ordered sets are planar? Develop a good algorithm for testing an ordered set for planarity.*

It makes good sense to extend this problem to the class of oriented graphs which do not contain directed cycles. Just as is done with ordered sets, we can use diagrams for acyclic oriented graphs in which the orientation of edges is indicated by the orientation in the plane. In this way, an acyclic oriented graph can be nonplanar when the underlying undirected graph is planar.

**Problem 39.** *Which acyclic oriented graphs are planar? Provide an efficient algorithm which tests planarity. Also characterize planarity for acyclic oriented graphs by providing a list of forbidden subgraphs.*

Some examples of forbidden subgraphs are given in [35]. One of the original motivations for studying planarity for ordered sets comes from dimension theory. A planar ordered set with greatest and least elements has dimension at most two. Trotter and Moore [36] showed that a planar ordered set with a least (or greatest) element has dimension at most three. However, D. Kelly [17] constructed planar ordered sets of arbitrary dimension.

**Problem 40.** *Do there exist dimension critical planar ordered sets of arbitrary dimension?*

I have just learned from W. Schnyder of the following beautiful result he has recently proved. With a graph  $G = (V, E)$ , we associate an ordered set  $(X, P)$  defined by  $X = V \cup E$  with  $x < e$  in  $P$  if and only if the vertex  $x$  is an endpoint of the edge  $e$ . Schnyder proved [33] that the graph  $G$  is planar if and only if the dimension of the associated ordered set is at most three.

**Problem 41.** *Does there exist a function  $f(n)$  so that if  $G$  is a graph of genus  $n$ , then the dimension of the associated ordered set is at most  $f(n)$ ?*

**Problem 42.** *Does there exist a function  $g(n)$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is the ordered set associated with the graph  $G$ , and  $\dim(X, P) = n$ , then the chromatic number of  $G$  is at most  $g(n)$ ?*

The preceding problem is related in spirit to the famous problem involving the existence of graphs with bounded maximum clique size and arbitrarily large chromatic number. The reverse problem is easier since it is easy to show that there exists an absolute constant  $c$  so that if  $(X, P)$  is the ordered set associated with graph  $G$ , and the chromatic number of  $G$  is  $n$ , then  $\dim(X, P) < c \log \log n$ . Apart from the value of the constant  $c$ , this result is best possible. This is shown by the complete graph on  $n$  vertices.

## 8 Miscellaneous problems

We have not included in this paper any Sperner theory problems only because in most cases, the formulation of these problems requires additional background material. However, we must comment that there are a large number of important problems in this area and we refer the reader to Griggs' survey article [13] for a sampling. For similar reasons, we have not discussed problems from combinatorial lattice theory.

There are a tremendous number of challenging and easily accessible problems dealing with families of subsets of a set. Here is one of my favorites. It comes from P. Frankl.

**Problem 43.** *Prove that there exists an absolute constant  $\varepsilon$  so that whenever  $F$  is a family of sets closed under unions, i.e.,  $A \cup B \in F$  for every  $A, B \in F$ , then there is an element which belongs to at least  $\varepsilon|F|$  of the sets in  $F$ .*

Actually, Frankl conjectures that the value  $\varepsilon = 1/2$  works. This value is best possible as the family of all subsets of a set shows.

Here is another posed by D. Kleitman.

**Problem 44.** *How many colors are required to assign colors to the subsets of  $\{1, 2, \dots, n\}$  so that for each  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , the family  $F_i$  of subsets assigned color  $i$  is completely union free, i.e., if  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_k, A_{k+1} \in F_i$ , then  $A_1 \cup A_2 \cup \dots \cup A_k \neq A_{k+1}$ ?*

It is easy to see that  $n + 1$  colors suffice since we can assign a set  $A$  its cardinality as a color. An easy inductive argument shows that the number of colors required is at least  $n/2$ .

Call a graph  $G$  a *cover graph* if there is a drawing of  $G$  in the plane which yields the diagram of an ordered set. It is obvious that a cover graph has no triangles. O. Pretzel [28] has constructed a graph of girth six which

*Problems and Conjectures*

is not a cover graph. of graphs with arbitrary

**Problem 45.** *Give examples of graphs of girth which are not cover graphs.*

The following problem is due to

**Problem 46.** *Let  $f(n)$  be the number of cover graphs of a set of size  $n$ . Show that  $f(n) = o(n)$ .*

J. Nešetřil asks the following

**Problem 47.** *If  $C_1, C_2, \dots, C_k$  are classes of graphs so that if the edges of a graph form an induced copy of  $C_i$  then the graph is in  $C_i$ .*

There are a number of problems involving hamiltonian cycles in graphs. L. Lovasz for vertex cover problems. I am not sure who should be credited. D. Kleitman, Oberwolfach, and so on.

**Problem 48.** *Consider the middle two levels in the Boolean lattice of a set of  $2n + 1$  elements.*

We close this paper with

**Problem 49.** *What is the maximum number of points contained in a line in a set of  $n$  points in the plane?*

These three authors are working on every ordered set on  $n$  points which all maximal chains of length  $c$  is easy to establish. It is possible except for the case of  $c = 2$ . representative of the future.

is not a cover graph. J. Nešetřil and V. Rödl [27] have shown the existence of graphs with arbitrarily large girth which are not cover graphs.

**Problem 45.** *Give an explicit construction for graphs of arbitrarily large girth which are not cover graphs.*

The following problem comes from P. Erdős.

**Problem 46.** *Let  $f(n)$  denote the minimum value of the independence number among all cover graphs on  $n$  vertices. An old construction of Erdős shows  $f(n) = o(n)$ . Is it true that  $f(n) \geq n^{1-\epsilon}$ ?*

J. Nešetřil asks the following question.

**Problem 47.** *If  $C_1$  is a cover graph, does there exist a cover graph  $C_2$  so that if the edges of  $C_2$  are partitioned into two classes, then there exists an induced copy of  $C_1$  so that all the edges in this copy belong to the same class?*

There are a number of difficult problems involving the existence of hamiltonian cycles in graphs, in particular the well known conjecture of L. Lovasz for vertex transitive graphs. Here is a special case for ordered sets. I am not sure who first posed the problem. I first heard about it from I. Dejter who credits it to P. Erdős, but perhaps someone else should be credited. D. Kelly has posed the problem at conferences in Banff and Oberwolfach, and so has I. Havel in Prague.

**Problem 48.** *Consider the bipartite graph formed by the vertices in the middle two levels in the diagram for the ordered set consisting of all subsets of a set of  $2n + 1$  elements ordered by inclusion. Is this graph hamiltonian?*

We close this paper with a problem of Linial, Saks and Schor [25]:

**Problem 49.** *What is the largest integer  $f(n, d)$  so that every ordered set on  $n$  points contains a  $d$ -dimensional subordered set on  $f(n, d)$  points?*

These three authors have shown that there exists a constant  $c$  so that every ordered set on  $n$  points contains a subordered set on  $c\sqrt{n}$  points in which all maximal chains have the same length. Of course the existence of  $c$  is easy to establish, but they have also shown that the result is best possible except for the precise value of the constant  $c$ . This problem is representative of the type of problem which deserves more attention in the future.

## Acknowledgements

The author would like to express his appreciation to the University of Paris/Orsay and to the organizers of the Dirac Conference in Sønderborg, Denmark and the Conference on Graphs and Ordered Sets in Arcata, California in the summer of 1985. The author would also like to acknowledge the assistance of many friends and colleagues in the formulation of the problems and conjectures formulated in this manuscript, especially P. Erdős, P. Fishburn, Z. Füredi, J. Griggs, J. Kahn, H. Kierstead, G. McNulty, J. Nešetřil, M. Paoli, I. Rival, V. Rödl, M. Saks, J. Schmerl, J. Walker and D. West.

## References

- [1] M. Aigner, "A note on merging," *Order* **2** (1985), 257-264.
- [2] K. Baker, "Dimension, join independence and breadth in partially ordered sets." Unpublished notes.
- [3] K. Bogart and W. Trotter, "On the complexity of posets," *Discrete Math.* **16** (1976), 71-82.
- [4] K. Bogart, I. Rabinovitch and W. Trotter, "A bound on the dimension of interval orders," *J. Combin. Theory (A)* **21** (1976), 319-328.
- [5] M. El-Zahar and I. Rival, "Examples of jump-critical ordered sets," *SIAM J. Alg. Discr. Meth.* (1985). To appear.
- [6] M. El-Zahar and J. Schmerl, "On the size of jump-critical ordered sets," *Order* **1** (1984), 3-6.
- [7] P. Fishburn, *Interval orders and interval graphs*, Wiley, New York (1985).
- [8] P. Fishburn and W. Trotter, "Angle orders," *Order* **1** (1985), 333-344.
- [9] M. Fredman, "How good is the information theory bound in sorting," *Theoretical Computer Science* **1** (1979), 355-361.
- [10] Z. Füredi and J. Kahn, "On the dimension of partially ordered sets," *Order*. To appear.
- [11] Z. Füredi and J. Kahn. Personal Communication.

- [12] B. Ganter, P. M. Hersh, "The dimension of the lattice of dimerizations," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [13] J. Griggs, "The dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1984), 397-400.
- [14] T. Hiraguchi, "On the dimension of posets," *Kanazawa U. J. Sci.* **15** (1983), 1-10.
- [15] J. Kahn and M. Saks, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1984), 113-126.
- [16] D. Kelly, "Remarks on posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 218.
- [17] D. Kelly, "On the dimension of posets," *Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [18] H. Kierstead, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [19] H. Kierstead, "On the dimension of posets," *Math. Soc.* **268** (1982), 1-10.
- [20] H. Kierstead, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [21] H. Kierstead, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [22] H. Kierstead and J. Schmerl, "On the dimension of posets," *Combinatorics*, *Colloq. Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [23] H. Kierstead and J. Schmerl, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [24] N. Linial, "The dimension of posets," *J. Comput.* **13** (1982), 1-10.
- [25] N. Linial, M. Saks, "On the dimension of posets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [26] J. Nešetřil and J. Schmerl, "On the dimension of posets," *Algebraic Combinatorics*, *Proc. A.M.S.* **35** (1982), 1-10.
- [27] J. Nešetřil and J. Schmerl, "On the dimension of posets," *Proc. A.M.S.* **35** (1982), 1-10.

- [12] B. Ganter, P. Nevermann, K. Reuter and J. Stahl, "How small can a lattice of dimension  $n$  be?" To appear.
- [13] J. Griggs, "The Sperner property," *Annals of Discrete Math.* **23** (1984), 397–408.
- [14] T. Hiraguchi, "On the dimension of partially ordered sets," *Sci. Rep. Kanazawa U.* **1** (1951), 77–94.
- [15] J. Kahn and M. Saks, "Balancing poset extensions," *Order* **1** (1984), 113–126.
- [16] D. Kelly, "Removable pairs in dimension theory," *Order* **1** (1984), 217–218.
- [17] D. Kelly, "On the dimension of partially ordered sets," *Discrete Math.* **35** (1981), 135–156.
- [18] H. Kierstead, "Recursive ordered sets." To appear.
- [19] H. Kierstead, "An effective version of Dilworth's theorem," *Trans. Am. Math. Soc.* **268** (1981), 63–77.
- [20] H. Kierstead, G. McNulty and W. Trotter, "A Theory of recursive dimension for ordered sets," *Order* **1** (1984), 67–82.
- [21] H. Kierstead, E. Szemerédi and W. Trotter, "On coloring graphs with locally small chromatic number," *Combinatorica* **4** (1984), 183–185.
- [22] H. Kierstead and W. Trotter, "An extremal problem in recursive combinatorics," *Congressus Numerantium* **33**, 145–153.
- [23] H. Kierstead and W. Trotter, "A Ramsey theoretic problem for ordered sets," *Discrete Math.* To appear.
- [24] N. Linial, "The information theoretic bound is good for sorting," *SIAM J. Comput.* **13** (1984), 795–801.
- [25] N. Linial, M. Saks and P. Schor, "Largest induced suborders satisfying the chain condition," *Order* **2** (1985), 265–268.
- [26] J. Nešetřil and V. Rödl, "Combinatorial partitions of finite posets and lattices," *Algebra Universalis* **19** (1984), 106–119.
- [27] J. Nešetřil and V. Rödl, "On a Probabilistic Graph-Theoretic Method," *Proc. Am. Mat. Soc.* **72** (1978), 417–421.



- [28] O. Pretzel, "A Non-Covering Graph of Girth Six," *Discrete Math.* To appear.
- [29] I. Rabinovitch, "An Upper Bound on the Dimension of Interval Orders," *J. Combin. Theory (A)* (1978), 68-71.
- [30] V. Rödl and W. Trotter, "An Improved bound on the Dimension of Interval Orders." To appear.
- [31] M. Saks, "Balancing Extensions of Ordered Sets," *Order* 2 (1985), 327-330.
- [32] J. Schmerl, "Posets with Small Width and Large Jump Number," *Order*. To appear.
- [33] W. Schnyder. Personal Communication.
- [34] W. Trotter, "The Dimension of the Cartesian Product of Partial Orders," *Discrete Math.* 53 (1985), 255-263.
- [35] W. Trotter, "Order Preserving Embeddings of Aographs," *Springer Verlag Lecture Notes in Math.* 642 (1978), 572-579.
- [36] W. Trotter and J. Moore, "The Dimension of Planar Posets," *J. Combin. Theory (B)* 22 (1977), 54-67.

A Pr

Ded

A new, short p  
presented.

1. This classical th  
been proved many  
1954 by Dirac and  
(cf. Thomassen's re  
Kennedy, Quintas a

**Theorem.** *A grap  
 $K_5$  or  $K_{3,3}$ .*

The purpose of  
part of the Kuratov  
imagined counterex

2. Let  $G$  be a non-p  
having as few vertic  
connected and with  
that  $G$  contains a s  
one edge) or a sub  
assumption. We no  
Say that two edges  
outside  $H$ . This ge  
subgraph formed by

We shall see tha  
 $H$  be a  $K_5^-$  (undivi  
and meets at least t